Monitoring and Evaluation Case Studies of the Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders

UNITED NATIONS
APCICT – ESCAP

Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders

Monitoring & Evaluation Case Studies

Lead Author
Rutth Rosario D. Gerochi

Supporting Authors
Maria Veronica P. Angeles
Maria Cecilia Cuyugan Bulos
Maria Victoria R. Gustilo

APCICT

ASIAN AND PACIFIC TRAINING CENTRE FOR INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY FOR DEVELOPMENT

The Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders

Monitoring & Evaluation Case Studies

Contact:
United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Centre for Information
and Communication Technology for Development (UN-APCICT/ESCAP)
5F G-Tower, 175 Art center daero, Yeonsu-gu,
Incheon, Republic of Korea

Tel: +82 32 458 6650
Fax: +82 32 458 6691
E-mail: info@unapcict.org
http://www.unapcict.org

Design and Layout: Jieum design

Table of Contents

Acronyms
Preface

1. Case Study 1: Indonesia

Ministry of Communication and Information Technology, Faculty of Computer Science of the University of Indonesia

2. Case Study 2: The Philippines

National Computer Institute

3. Case Study3: Tajikistan

Public Fund Civil Internet Policy Initiative

Acronyms

Academy	Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders
CICT	Public organization Centre ICT
CIO	Chief Information Officer
CIPI	Public Fund Civil Internet Policy Initiative
CM	Competency
CR	Curriculum
FOSS	Free and open source software
GCIO	Government Chief Information Officer
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ICTD	ICT for development
IES	Institute of Entrepreneurship and Service
IS	Information Systems
ISPA	Association of Internet Service Providers
IT	Information Technology
ITB	Institut Teknologi Bandung / Bandung Institute of Technology
ITS	Institut Teknologi Sepuluh Nopember / Sepuluh Nopember Institute of Technology
KOVA	Public organization Center of Information Technology
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MATHEMA	Public organization Information Analytical and Education Centre
MCIT	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (MCIT)
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
NCC	National Computer Center
NCI	National Computer Institute
NGOs	Non-governmental organizations
PFI	Public Fund Internet
PM	Programme Management
TARENA	Tajik Academic Research and Education Networking Association
UGM	Universitas Gadjah Mada / Gadjah Mada University
UI	University of Indonesia
UN-APCICT	United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Center for Information and Communication Technology for Development
UNP	Universitas Negeri Padang / Padang State University

Preface

The United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Centre for Information and Communication Technology for Development (UN-APCICT) is pleased to present the 'Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Case Studies' of the Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders (Academy), APCICT's flagship training programme for government officials on ICT for development. It is published as a follow-up publication to the Academy M&E Toolkit to provide a compilation of field experiences on the Toolkit.

As a regional institution of the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) mandated to support capacity-building of the Member States in ICT for development, APCICT has developed and executed many impactful ICTD programmes. The Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders (Academy) is one of APCICT's flagship training programmes designed to equip government officials with necessary knowledge to leverage ICTs in achieving national development goals. Since its launch in 2008, the Academy programme has been successfully rolled-out in 27 countries across the Asia Pacific region through institutionalization into numerous government human resource training frameworks and university curricula with active support of national and sub-regional partners.

The rapid uptake of the Academy programme across Asia and the Pacific region called for a comprehensive and streamlined approach to monitoring and evaluating the progress and achievements of the Academy programme, so as to better manage outputs and outcomes and improve future programme implementation. In response to this need, APCICT developed a Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) framework in 2010, and subsequently, the Academy M&E Toolkit in 2013. The Toolkit aims to provide national and sub-regional partners with practical, step-by-step guidelines for monitoring and evaluating the Academy programme by helping the partners map out, customize and strengthen M&E plans and systems in their organizations.

The 'M&E Case Studies', the latest addition to M&E resources for the Academy, represents continued efforts by APCICT to enhance monitoring and evaluation of the Academy programme and improve its delivery at the national level. It documents the field testing experience of the M&E Toolkit by partners implementing the Academy programme in Indonesia, the Philippines, and Tajikistan. The field tests were undertaken by select implementing partners to assess the practical application of the Toolkit at the national level. Each case study introduces the status of the Academy programme roll-out, key M&E activities undertaken, challenges, and suggested M&E strategies and recommendations in the respective countries. The case study exercise enabled the partners to fine-tune the M&E Toolkit by tailoring it to their own contexts, and to share lessons learned and insights from the field.

I am happy to note that a strong participatory approach is another hallmark of this publication. Our local partners and related government institutions have been actively engaged not only in programme implementation, but also in M&E activities. We believe that a robust local ownership is critical in ensuring the long-term sustainability of any programme, and hope that these efforts will help build and strengthen local ownership and M&E capabilities.

In closing, I would like to extend my sincere appreciation to Rutth Gerochi, the coordinator and case designer, and Judith de Guzman, the case writer. I also wish to thank our partners for contributing cases to this publication, namely, Yvette Cabrera and Jun Ventanilla from the Philippines, Asomiddin Atoev from Tajikistan, and Yudho Giri Sucahyo and Udi Rusadi from Indonesia. In addition, let me express my appreciation to our partner organizations that contributed to this case study exercise, namely, the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology of Indonesia and the Faculty of Computer Science of the University of Indonesia, the National Computer Institute of the Philippines, and the Public Fund Civil Internet Policy Initiative of Tajikistan.

Monitoring and Evaluation can play an instrumental role in building an evidence base for current and future programes. I hope that the Monitoring and Evaluation Case Studies will serve as useful references for our partners in Asia and the Pacific region, and help further improve the effectiveness of the Academy programme.

Hyeun-Suk Rhee, Ph.D
Director
UN-APCICT/ESCAP

CASE STUDY 1:

INDONESIA

Partner Organizations: Ministry of Communication and Information Technology, Faculty of Computer Science of the University of Indonesia

INTRODUCTION

The Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders is implemented in Indonesia through a partnership between the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (MCIT) and the Faculty of Computer Science of the University of Indonesia. MCIT is a government organization that aims to assist in the development of Indonesian society through effective and efficient implementation of information and communication technology (ICT) initiatives. To achieve this, MCIT carries out the following functions: (1) creation and implementation of policies in the field of ICT, (2) provision of technical guidance and supervision in relation to ICT matters, and (3) implementation of ICT-related activities and services in the country. Similarly, the Faculty of Computer Science of the University of Indonesia was established in view of developing the fields of computer science and information technology in Indonesia. Its main thrusts include research and education in computer science and information technology for social development.

STATUS OF THE ACADEMY PROGRAMME ROLL-OUT

Key Targets for Academy Programme Roll-out for the Years 2012 ~ 2014

Proponents of the Academy Programme in Indonesia have identified several key targets for its roll-out in the years 2012-2014. These key targets are divided into four programme areas: curriculum, competency, programme management and external impact.

First, in line with curriculum, the Academy Programme aims to enhance the delivery of content about ICT and ensure active participation from stakeholders through the use of local case studies based on ICT experiences in Indonesia. Another desired outcome for the roll-out of the Academy Programme in Indonesia pertained to the formation of a faculty pool with credibility and expertise in delivering the programme modules.

Second, in relation to competency, the implementation of the Academy Programme in Indonesia seeks to train and produce government leaders who are equipped with basic competencies to be the future Government Chief Information Officer (GCIO).

Third, in the area of programme management, proponents of the Academy Programme in Indonesia aim to ensure that the GCIO certification programme is efficiently and effectively managed.

Finally, in view of external impact, the roll-out of the Academy Programme in Indonesia should be able to produce government leaders who are able to leverage ICT for development in their respective organizations and regions.

Annex A.1 shows the specific performance indicators and targets that were developed for the Academy Programme roll-out in Indonesia for the years 2012-2014.

Figure 1: The First Regional Training of Trainers in June 2008 for Modules 1, 2 and 3. A delegation from Indonesia was invited to attend this event

Key Activities Implemented in Support of Academy Programme Roll-out

Since 2008, several key activities have been implemented in support of the Academy Programme roll-out in Indonesia. In 2008, Academy modules 7 and 8 were field tested in Jakarta, Indonesia in a sub-regional workshop for South-East Asian partners. This workshop was made possible through cooperation between the United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Centre for Information and Communication Technology for Development (UN-APCICT) and MCIT, as well as through the participation of partners from seven countries: Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Philippines, Thailand, Timor-Leste and Viet Nam.

From 2008 ~ 2011, the preparation of materials and trainers for the roll-out of the Academy Programme in Indonesia were undertaken. This phase included two main activities: (1) Training of Trainers for the Academy modules and (2) translation of the modules into Bahasa Indonesia

Figure 2: The Second Regional Training of Trainers in March 2009 for Modules 4, 5 and 6. A delegation from Indonesia was invited to attend this event

Figure 3: Regional Workshop in November 2009 for Module 8. A delegation from Indonesia was invited to attend this event

Figure 4: Regional Training of Trainers Workshop in February 2011 for Modules 9 and 10. Two delegations from Indonesia were invited to attend this event

From 2009 ~ 2010 the Academy Programme modules were delivered nationwide through a series of workshops. Table 1 presents an overview of the workhops that were conducted as part of the Academy Programme.

Title	Date	Venue	Topics Covered	Participants
First National Workshop (2009)	30 March ~ 2 April 2009	Bali	Modules 1, 2	26 local government leaders
Second National Workshop (2009)	27 ~ 30 April 2009	Cisarua, Bogor, West Java	Modules 3, 4, 5	31 local government leaders
Third National Workshop (2009)	30 June ~ 3 July 2009	Solo, Central Java	Modules 6, 7, 8	30 local government leaders
First National Workshop (2010)	18 ~ 20 March 2010	Padang, Sumatra Island	Modules 1, 2, 3, 6	40 local government leaders
Second National Workshop (2010)	23 ~ 25 September 2010	Gorontalo, Celebes Island	Modules 1, 2, 3, 6	40 local government leaders
Third National Workshop (2010)	18 ~ 20 October 2010	Jakarta	Modules 1, 2, 3, 6	40 central government leaders
Fourth National Workshop (2010)	20 November ~ 2 December 2010	Denpasar, Bali	Modules 1, 2, 3, 6	40 local government leaders

Table 1: An Overview of National Workshops of the Academy Programme in Indonesia

Figure 5: First National Workshop in Bali on 30 March ~ 2 April 2009

In 2010, training materials for special topics, such as IT planning, IT governance and GCIO, were developed. In 2011, the certification exam for the GCIO was launched through the integration of the Academy Programme modules with the GCIO resource materials. This was soon followed in 2012 with the addition of a "How-To" series based on the Academy Programme modules. The GCIO certification and the "How-To" series were held in six locations (Jakarta, Riau, South Sumatera, Central Kalimantan, Gorontalo, and East Nusa Tenggara) with a total of 313 participants.

Challenges Encountered and Lessons Learned in the Academy Programme Roll-out

Proponents of the Academy Programme in Indonesia have cited several challenges that they have encountered as they rolled out events and activities in support of the Academy. One significant challenge involves getting the right participants for the programme. To address this, proponents have specified in invitation letters, the minimum rank of government officials who should attend the trainings.

Another challenge pertains to the need for more local case studies to chronicle the experiences of different groups in relation to ICT for development (ICTD). To address this challenge, proponents of the Academy Programme in Indonesia have included the development of local case studies as one of the key indicators in their monitoring and evaluation (M&E) plan. This has motivated stakeholders to actively craft case studies on local ICTD experiences.

A third challenge that has been observed during the roll-out of the Academy Programme is the need to balance between theory and best practices, particularly between knowledge and experience. In response to this, proponents have set up specific guidelines to select resource persons who have enough field experience in the subject that they will be teaching.

In relation to these challenges, a key factor that has contributed to the success of the Academy Programme implementation in Indonesia is the synergy among various institutions, with UN-APCICT providing the modules and resources for translating the modules, MCIT providing material resources for the roll-out of the Academy Programme in the country, University of Indonesia undertaking the translation of the modules and providing resource persons for the workshops, local government agencies supporting their officers to participate in the workshops, and other universities serving as a pool of resource persons for the programme.

Figure 6: Second National Workshop in Cisarua, Bogor on 27 ~ 30 April 2009

Key Results Based on Indicators and Targets Identified for the Academy Programme Roll-out

An assessment of the impact of the activities undertaken in 2009-2012 in support of the Academy Programme roll-out points to several gains.

Follow-up with participants from the training workshops held in 2009 showed some of the participants utilizing their learnings to promote ICTD in their respective areas. For instance, a participant made arrangements with a telecommunications company to set up a hotspot area in his region, and another participant developed an IT plan that incorporated the use of ICTs for social and economic development in her area. In one case, a participant from the provincial government office collaborated with several municipalities to shift to the use of open source software in their government offices. In addition to these accomplishments, two important events contributed to the successful roll-out of the Academy Programme in Indonesia: (1) the establishment of the National e-Government Forum on 31 May 2009 and (2) the drafting of the e-Government regulation on 20-21 October 2009.

Figure 7: Third National Workshop in Solo on 30 June ~ 3 July 2009

In 2010, the First Annual National e-Government Forum was held wherein the Academy Programme alumni participated as focal points during the meeting. In the Second Annual National e-Government Forum organized in 2011, most of the Academy Programme alumni were committee members of the forum. Another positive result from the programme roll-out was the integration of the Academy modules into the curriculum of the Master of IT programme at the University of Indonesia. In support of this desired outcome, MCIT provided fellowships for this master's degree programme. When the GCIO Competencies Standard and Certifications were launched in 2011, the University of Indonesia and four other universities offered government leaders scholarships for the Master of IT programme.

In 2012, the National e-Government Forum started to meet once every semester, with the Academy alumni playing key roles in the forum meetings. Furthermore, in October 2012, Indonesia launched the Regulation on Electronic System and Transaction Operation, which stipulates that all experts employed by an electronic system operator should have competencies in Electronic System of Information Technology (Article 10 Paragraph 1). This regulation also states that these experts should possess a certificate of expertise (Article 10 Paragraph 2). In effect, this new regulation further strengthens the position of the GCIO and its corresponding certification.

Figure 8: First National Workshop in Padang, Sumatra Island on 18 ~ 20 March 2010

Figure 9: Second National Workshop in Gorontalo, Celebes Island on 23 ~ 25 September 2010

MONITORING AND EVALUATION EXPERIENCE IN THE ACADEMY PROGRAMME ROLL-OUT

Development of Monitoring and Evaluation Plan for the Academy Programme Roll-out

The development of the M&E Plan for the Academy Programme roll-out in Indonesia was conducted through a three-stage process involving focus group discussions with stakeholders of the Academy (i.e. central government led by MCIT, local government, and universities). The first stage covered the development of the annual M&E plan, through the definition of programme areas, desired outcomes, indicators and targets for the programme roll-out.

The second stage involved the development of the M&E methods and schedule. This included defining areas and elements for measurement. Additionally, in this stage, programme proponents put forth the specific steps and timeframes for programme monitoring and overall evaluation. Specific M&E methods and activities included process evaluation, profile analysis, survey questionnaires, group discussions and interviews, and case studies.

Finally, the last stage of this development process pertained to the creation of a matrix highlighting the different indicators for M&E. In particular, programme proponents identified inputs, processes and outputs that will be utilized for carrying out the M&E plan. The target stakeholders and users of M&E reports include MCIT, government agencies of the training participants, resource persons, university partners, and UN-APCICT.

At present, programme proponents have started developing M&E instruments and MCIT has initiated distribution of these instruments to participants to gather their views and feedback regarding the Academy Programme. Annex A.2 shows some of the instruments that MCIT has developed for M&E of the Academy Programme roll-out in Indonesia. The first instrument is meant to be accomplished by the training instructor for the GCIO certification and seeks to gather information regarding the educational and technical background of the instructor as well as the implementation of the training. The second instrument is supposed to be completed by the training organizer and aims to collect data regarding the programme indicators, targets and achievements. Finally, the last instrument provides training participants with a channel to give feedback about the training. Specifically, the instrument asks training participants to give their opinions regarding particular aspects of the training, such as materials, content and schedule. In addition, this instrument also solicits inputs from participants about obstacles that they experienced in relation to the training, their future plans after the training, and their suggestions for improving the training programme.

As the proponents of the Academy Programme roll-out in Indonesia are still in the process of developing and refining their M&E plan, inputs regarding the benefits and advantages derived, the challenges encountered and the lessons learned from implementing their M&E plan are yet to be identified based on their experiences.

Lessons Learned and Future Actions in Relation to Developing the M&E Plan for Academy Programme Roll-out

In the process of developing the M&E plan for the roll-out of the Academy Programme in Indonesia, proponents have emphasized the importance of identifying the right indicators and setting the right targets to fit the limited resources available for the implementation of the Academy Programme.

In the future, proponents of the Academy Programme in Indonesia intend to make M&E a part of day-to-day operations and assign a dedicated staff to handle M&E activities and issues.

Annex A.1

Targets for Academy Programme Roll-out for the period 2012 ~ 2014

Developed by
Ministry of Communication and Information Technology and
Faculty of Computer Science of the University of Indonesia

Programme Area: Curriculum	
Desired outcome: Enhance the delivery of content with local case studies and ensure active participation.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Number of local case studies	• 1 case study per competency
• Language adaptation	• All workshops delivered in Bahasa Indonesia
• Number of sessions allocated for discussion/case studies	• 1 session is dedicated for case study discussion
• Number of responses during discussion	• 1 presentation per group including Q&A
• Number of support staff	• 5 support staff members for the whole activity
• Amount of allocated budget	• USD 200,000 per year for the whole activity
• Updated Certification Exams	• 2 new questions per year for each competency
Desired outcome: Faculty pool has credibility and expertise in delivering programme modules.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Partnership with reputable universities	• Cooperation with 5 top universities: UI, UGM, ITB, ITS, UNP
• Number of resource persons	• 4 resource persons per university
• Education background	• Minimum master's degree, preferably a doctoral degree
• Practical knowledge	• Minimum 10 years of experience in postgraduate studies and in the ICTD field

Programme Area: Competency	
Desired outcome: Government leaders equipped with basic competencies to be the future GCIO (Government Chief Information Officer)	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Number of competencies	• 8 basic competencies from 8 sessions in the training
• Number of invited government leaders	• 500 participants
• Reach of participants	• 7 locations
• Number of resource persons	• Minimum of 4 resource persons per workshop
• Number of participants in attendance	• 0 participants / workshop - in total 350 participants
• Profile of participants	• Minimum 3rd rank
• Number of participants who pass	• 50% of attended participants pass the Certification Exam
• Number of support staff	• 5 support staff members for the whole activity
• Amount of allocated budget	• USD 200,000 per year for the whole activity
• Local support from local government	• MCIT covers the cost of training venue and resource persons • Local government agencies cover the cost of accommodation

Programme Area: Programme Management	
Desired outcome: GCIO certification programme is efficiently and effectively managed.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Number of GCIO workshops	• 7 workshops
• Regular feedback of performance	• Establish M&E tools and methods
• Networking with regional programme partner	• Active participation in the UN-APCICT meeting
• Networking with top universities	• Representatives from 5 top universities participate in annual meeting
• Focus more on providing competency-based training	• Curriculum is more focused on 8 basic competencies
• Promotional materials	• 1 brochure per university, 2 collective promotions

Programme Area: External Impact	
Desired outcome: Government leaders are able to apply ICTD in their organizations/ regions.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Contribution of programme in applying ICTD in government agencies/regions	• Government officials give feedback on the impact of the programme in their agencies/regions/career path
• Number of government leaders equipped with GCIO competencies	• 200 persons per year
• Number of ICTD programmes developed by participants	• 2 programmes per year
• Number of support staff	• 5 support staff members for the whole activity
• Amount of allocated budget	• USD 200,000 per year for the whole activity

Annex A.2

Monitoring and Evaluation Instruments developed by the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology in Indonesia for the Academy Programme Roll-out

MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY
REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA

Jl. Medan Merdeka Barat No. 9, Jakarta Pusat 10110. Tel./Fax: (021) 3856068

Monitoring and Evaluation for GCIO Certification

Name of Instructor : _____

University : _____

Please fill in the form below based on your experience in conveying the GCIO Certification for year 20____.

Module	
Case study topics to be added as lecturing materials	
Language used in case studies (Bahasa Indonesia/local/ mixed)	
Length of time used for discussion	
Number of participants that actively joined the discussion (question and answer sessions)	
Number of staff members that supported the preparation and lectures	
Number of exam questions per module updated every year	
Number of instructors (for overall module)	
Educational background of instructors	
Experience in managing, implementing and/or coordinating ICTD projects	

MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY
REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA

Jl. Medan Merdeka Barat No. 9, Jakarta Pusat 10110. Tel./Fax: (021) 3856068

Instrument for Training Organizer

INDICATOR	TARGET	REALIZATION	ACHIEVEMENTS
Competencies	The 8 competencies of GCIOs	Competencies delivered: _____	
Number of resource persons	At least 4 resource persons for each GCIO workshop	Number of resource persons delivered the training: _____	
Number of participants attended / Class size	50 participants expected in each workshop	Participants invited: _____ Participants attended: _____	
Profile of participants who attended the training	Minimum third rank officers from central and local governments	Officers third rank and above invited: _____ Officers third rank and above attended: _____	
Certification exam	In each workshop, minimum half of the participants attended pass the certification exam	Participants who passed the exam: _____	
Number of support staff	5 support staff members for the whole activity	Number of support staff: _____	
Amount of allocated budget	100% of planned budget is spent for the whole activity	Spent budget: _____	
Support from local governments (when the event is not located in Jakarta)	50% of support staff from local government	Number of support staff and percentage that are from local government: _____	

MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY
REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA

Jl. Medan Merdeka Barat No. 9, Jakarta Pusat 10110. Tel./Fax: (021) 3856068

GCIO Certification - Questionnaire
Evaluation of the Implementation

Name of institution/agency : _____

Address : _____

e-Mail : _____

Phone/Mobile phone number : _____

1. Before attending the Training, have you ever attended any GCIO activities?

- Yes **(Answers can be more than one)**:
  a. At the central/local government agency
  b. At a formal education institution
  c. At a non-formal education institution
  d. Others (please specify) .....

- Never

2. Concerning the Training material conveyed, is it consistent with your needs? **(choose one answer)**

a. Very consistent
b. Consistent
c. Less consistent
d. Not consistent
e. Unsure

3. Is the Training period of time sufficient enough for you to reach your objectives? **(choose one answer)**

a. Very sufficient
b. Sufficient
c. Less sufficient
d. Not sufficient
e. Unsure

4. In order to develop the GCIO in your profession, is the Training material beneficial? (**choose one answer)**

a. Very beneficial
b. Beneficial
c. Less beneficial
d. Not beneficial
e. Unsure

5. After attending the Training, mention your next plan **(choose one answer)**:

a. Have a discussion with your superior or colleagues concerning the importance of GCIO
b. Suggest to your superior to determine the GCIO Official
c. Re-learning the GCIO competence
d. Others (please specify) .....

6. In your opinion, what are the obstacles in realizing the GCIO? **(answers can be more than one)**

a. The structure/institution of the GCIO
b. The competence of the human resources
c. The organization culture
d. The leadership
e. Others (please specify) .....

7. In your opinion, how is the difficulty level of the Training material for each module? (give a check sign ✔)

	Very difficult	Difficult	Unsure	Easy	Very easy
Module 1					
Module 2					
Module 3					
Module 4					
Module 5					
Module 6					
Module 7					
Module 8					

8. Advice and follow up for the Training **(answers can be more than one)**:

a. There is a need to establish a membership organization network
b. There is a need for an alumni GCIO Training mailing list as a means for communication
c. There is a need to establish a forum/institutional activities network
d. Others (please specify)

9. How many days in advance did your superior assigned you to attend the Training?

a. More than one week before
b. 5 ~ 7 days before
c. 3 ~ 4 days before
d. 1 ~ 2 days before

Reason: .....
.....
.....

10. Did your superior give you any briefing or specific instructions concerning your attendance in the Training? Please give an explanation.

11. During the Training, were there any tasks from your superior which forces you to miss one or more sessions?

CASE STUDY 2:

PHILIPPINES

Partner Organization: National Computer Institute

INTRODUCTION

The National Computer Institute (NCI) is the information and communication technology (ICT) training and education arm of and for the government under the ICT Office of the Department of Science and Technology of the Republic of the Philippines. As part of its mandate, the NCI designs and conducts various seminars and workshops in view of developing ICT knowledge and skills among stakeholders from different sectors of Philippine society—government, private industries, academe and civil society. It is a partner of the United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Centre for Information and Communication Technology for Development (UN-APCICT) in implementing the Academy of ICT Essentials for Government Leaders Programme.

STATUS OF THE ACADEMY PROGRAMME ROLL-OUT

Key Targets for Academy Programme Roll-out for the Years 2012 ~ 2014

The NCI has identified several key targets for the roll-out of the Academy Programme in 2012-2014, under four programme areas: curriculum, competency, programme management and external impact.

First, in terms of curriculum, the NCI seeks to develop a comprehensive and high-level ICT for Development Programme that is customized for Philippine government managers, and is modular to ensure flexibility for different learning participants and/or situations.

Second, in terms of competency, participants who have undergone the Academy Programme should be able to plan and implement current and emerging ICTs and e-government applications.

In line with the third area, programme management, the roll-out of the Academy Programme should result in a pool of ICT for development resource persons who have participated in training and networking activities.

Finally, in relation to external impact, the implementation of the Academy Programme should produce government policymakers and managers who are equipped with the knowledge and skills to strategically integrate ICT in development programmes and policies.

The specific measurement indicators and targets for each of these outcomes are presented in Annex B.1.

Key Activities Implemented in Support of Academy Programme Roll-out

The Academy Programme was formally launched in the Philippines on 24 March 2011 in an event that involved a stakeholders' briefing, module presentations and a press conference. This event was attended by government executives at both the local and national levels, representatives from both public and private educational institutions, as well as civil society and IT industry leaders.

Since its launch, the modules of the Academy Programme have been implemented by the NCI following two approaches: (1) Academy modules presented as is or (2) Academy modules integrated into various seminars and trainings conducted by the NCI. In line with the first approach, the following Academy modules are presented as stand-alone trainings: Management Programme for e-Governance; IT Audit, Security and Governance; Enterprise Architecture and e-Service Strategic Planning; and Managing ICT Services in Government-ITIL Framework.

Figure 10: Press Conference on the launch of the Academy Programme on 24 March 2011

Based on the second approach, the following Academy modules are customized and embedded within existing courses offered by the NCI: Network and Information Security and Privacy; ICTD Essentials for Government Managers; ICTD for Disaster Risk Reduction, Climate Change, Green Growth and Sustainable Development; and e-Government Project Management. In this approach, the Academy modules are customized and incorporated into particular talks, seminars and courses offered by the NCI. Annex B.2 shows the list of courses offered by the NCI in 2012.

An example of this customization and incorporation approach may be seen in two TechTalks conducted by the NCI in June 2011. The first TechTalk, entitled "ICT4ALL: Innovation, Technology and Diversity," brought together 150 ICT professionals from different sectors of society to discuss ICT issues. The second TechTalk, entitled "ICT4YOUTH: Empowering the Youth through ICT," raised the ICT awareness of 159 students and teachers from both public and private educational institutions. In both seminars, Academy Programme modules were included in the subject matter. For instance, in ICT4ALL, Academy modules on ICT for Development, Information Security Governance, Free and Open Source Software, and Green ICT were incorporated in the presentations. Similarly, in ICT4YOUTH, Academy modules on Green ICT, Climate Change and Basic Information Security were included in the presentations. In addition, UN-APCICT's programme on Turning Today's Youth into Tomorrow's Leaders was included in this seminar.

Figure 11: NCI TechTalk on "ICT4ALL: Innovation, Technology and Diversity" at the National Computer Center in Manila on 7 June 2011

Aside from implementing different courses in line with the Academy Programme, the NCI has established partnerships with some government agencies and institutions . Through these partnerships, the Academy modules are customized based on the specific needs of partner agencies. Moreover, the NCI continues to actively promote the Academy Programme modules to potential participants through marketing initiatives such as sending electronic mail invitations to government and non-government organizations.

On the whole, the NCI is continuously enhancing the Academy Programme through the customization, localization, marketing and delivery of the Academy modules in the Philippines.

Challenges Encountered and Lessons Learned in the Academy Programme Roll-out

Based on their experience of rolling-out the Academy Programme, NCI course officers have identified several challenges that they have encountered. First, one of these challenges points to the institutional status and changes in the NCI. Given the current re-organization efforts that are being undertaken in the NCI, there is a risk that course officers who have previously handled the Academy Programme may be re-assigned to other units in the institute, thus posing a challenge to continuity and sustainability in the implementation of the modules.

Second, although initial meetings have been conducted between NCI and government agencies for the customization and implementation of Academy Programme modules, there is still a lack of readiness in some of these agencies and institutions. In some instances, this problem may be traced to socio-political factors, such as the recent 2013 elections in the Philippines. Thus, NCI course officers have highlighted the need to constantly follow-up on these proposed partnerships in order to push for the implementation of the Academy Programme modules in these agencies and institutions.

A third challenge in the implementation of the Academy Programme is the difficulty of inviting participants from government agencies to NCI training seminars and courses. Such difficulty stems from several reasons. One reason pertains to government agencies lacking the necessary funds to send their employees to training seminars and courses. This situation is particularly evident in government regional offices. Another reason for this difficulty may be traced to the lack of supervisor support for employee training and development.

Another hurdle that has been identified pertains to poor targeting of participants such that there seems to be a mismatch between target and actual profiles of participants. The Academy Programme modules have been designed with government managers and supervisors as target participants. However, based on previous experiences in implementing the Academy Programme modules, it has been noted that some participants were from the staff level. This mismatch between target and actual profiles has resulted in a lack of appreciation and participation among participants who come from the staff level.

Finally, maximizing the value and impact of training seminars and courses is another significant challenge in the implementation of the Academy Programme. In some instances, participants attended the training for compliance and failed to utilize the knowledge and skills gained to implement the plans developed in these trainings once they returned to their respective agencies and institutions. Because some participants have been availing the training without any intention for utilization, the impact of the Academy Programme is undermined.

Key Results Based on Indicators and Targets Identified for the Academy Programme Roll-out

Annex B.3 shows the actions that are being undertaken to meet the indicators and targets set for the Academy Programme roll-out in the Philippines.

MONITORING AND EVALUATION EXPERIENCE IN THE ACADEMY PROGRAMME ROLL-OUT

Monitoring and Evaluation Activities Undertaken in the Academy Programme Roll-out

NCI conducts periodic monitoring and evaluation (M&E) activities for the roll-out of the Academy Programme. NCI course officers conduct two forms of evaluation. The first pertains to post-training evaluation while the second corresponds to stakeholder feedback collected after a certain amount of time from the end of the training.

In the post-training evaluation, participants are given the opportunity to evaluate the following components of the training through a written survey form: the relevance of the course, the effectiveness of the instructional methods used, and the efficiency of the resource person in terms of subject matter, communication skills and personal qualities. A sample of the post-training evaluation form is presented in Annex B.4.

In the second type of evaluation, training participants are given the opportunity to evaluate the training course that they participated in after they returned to their workplaces. This evaluation is conducted using the stakeholder feedback survey form that is sent to participants via electronic mail. Participants can also choose to complete the evaluation online. Through the stakeholder feedback form, participants are able to provide inputs regarding the following training components: training management, information and skills acquired, training and activity design, professional skill and knowledge of resource person about subject matter, course contents, and adequacy of facilities and laboratories. In addition, as participants have returned to their workplaces, they are asked to evaluate the relevance of the training to their line of work and to their organization. Participants are also asked to rate NCI client relations, provide additional topics that can be included in the course, describe their experiences with NCI service, highlight benefits that they have gained from the training, and point out areas of improvement for the trainings offered by NCI.

A sample of the stakeholder feedback survey form that is sent to participants of previous NCI trainings containing UN-APCICT Academy modules is shown in Annex B.5. The results from this stakeholder feedback survey form from 2012 training participants are shown in Annex B.6.

Benefits and Advantages of Monitoring and Evaluating the Academy Programme Roll-out

Several benefits and advantages of undertaking M&E for the Academy Programme have been identified. The first benefit is related to a shift in thinking among NCI course officers to focus on the quality, relevance and impact of training seminars and courses. Previously, NCI course officers conducted trainings for the sake of implementing projects, focusing on the number of participants and post-training evaluation as success indicators. However, through the Academy Programme, NCI course officers have increased their understanding and ability to use M&E results to continually improve performance and meet participants' needs. The course officers' focus have now shifted toward the quality, relevance and impact of trainings as success indicators, and are gathering information related to participants' recall (knowledge) and application (skills).

Figure 12: NCI TechTalk on "ICT4ALL: Innovation, Technology and Diversity" at the National Computer Center in Manila on 7 June 2011

A second advantage pertains to M&E results serving as a basis for introducing revisions to various aspects of a specific training activity. Thus, M&E results provide valuable inputs regarding additional topics, revisions in training materials, applicability to local context, and changes in sequencing and delivery. As such, insights from M&E have significantly contributed to making training initiatives more localized and more effective.

Challenges and Suggested M&E Strategies for the Academy Programme Roll-out

One of the main challenges that NCI course officers have encountered in conducting M&E is linked to a low response rate among training participants. As mentioned earlier, the stakeholder feedback survey form is sent to participants via electronic mail or accessed online. However, despite constant follow-ups, only around 20 per cent of the participants respond to requests for evaluation. In response to this challenge, one suggested strategy is to inquire about hindering factors among participants who fail to complete the evaluation and conduct activities to address these factors.

Another challenge that NCI course officers have identified from their experience of conducting M&E for the Academy Programme modules is the low quality of responses from evaluation instruments. Although participants oblige to accomplish the evaluation, the responses from some of these participants appear to lack insight on the relevance, quality and impact of the training courses. In some instances, participants provide incomplete or haphazard responses. To address this challenge, it is suggested that participants be informed ahead of time regarding the importance of accomplishing the evaluation survey form. Furthermore, in addition to survey forms, the use of focus group discussions has been suggested as another method for conducting evaluation of the Academy Programme modules.

In addition to these challenges, NCI course officers reiterate the risk brought about by the current re-organization that is being undertaken in the NCI. There exists the possibility of NCI course officers who have handled the implementation of the Academy Programme modules being re-assigned to other units in the NCI, thus posing a challenge to the continuity and sustainability of the Academy Programme roll-out. To mitigate this risk, NCI course officers have suggested fine-tuning M&E systems and processes, and developing the M&E competencies of other NCI personnel.

Lessons Learned and Future Actions for Monitoring and Evaluating the Academy Programme Roll-out

A key lesson is the importance of developing an M&E mindset. For NCI course officers, having an M&E mindset enables one to better understand and improve the relevance, quality and impact of the projects that one implements. Therefore, M&E should always be an important component of any project. Another important lesson gained from conducting M&E of the Academy Programme pertains to perceiving criticisms in a positive way. Thus, for the NCI course officers, M&E entails always being receptive to comments for improvements, although in some instances, such comments may take the form of criticisms.

Moving forward, NCI course officers have identified future plans of action in relation to the implementation of the Academy Programme and the improvement of M&E initiatives. First, it appears that there is a need to further improve M&E systems and processes in the NCI, particularly in the area of evaluation and reporting. Thus, from the data gathered, there is a need to conduct more in-depth analysis to identify strengths and weaknesses, as well as recommendations for utilization of the results. In addition, a need to customize M&E systems and processes according to the nature of a particular project has been noted. Upon strengthening the M&E systems and processes for the Academy Programme initiatives, a wider application of these systems and processes may then be undertaken by applying them to other initiatives of the NCI, thus maximizing the benefits that can be derived from M&E.

Annex B.1

Targets for Academy Programme Roll-out for the period 2012 ~ 2014

Developed by
National Computer Institute (Philippines)

Programme Area: Curriculum		
Desired outcome: A comprehensive, high-level ICT for Development (ICTD) Programme customized for Philippine government managers such as Division Chiefs, Directors, Commissioners and would-be managers within 1 year.		
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**
ICT for Development Programme	• Number of customized ICTD Programme conducted / implemented	• At least 4 Academy modules embedded in other modules per semester • At least 3 straight Academy modules per semester
	• Number of customized ICTD Programme enhanced	• 3 customized modules per year
	• Increased number of computer training laboratories	• Tie-up with local ICT training institutions, regional offices, state universities and colleges
	• Number of partners for offsite and remote operations / trainings	
Desired outcome: A modular programme approach to ensure flexibility to different learning participants and/or situations within 1 year.		
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**
Modular Programme	• Number of modules to be included per programme	• At least 2 modules per programme
	• Increased number of computer training laboratories	• Tie-up with local ICT training institutions, regional offices, state universities and colleges
	• Number of partners for offsite and remote operations / trainings	
Flexibility	• Number of sector-specific modular programme conducted / implemented	• At least 2 sector-specific modules per semester
	• Number of participants trained in sector-specific programme developed	• 100 participants per year
	• Number of sector-specific modular programme developed	• 2 programmes per year
	• Extent of correspondence between the sectoral programmes and specific needs	• Satisfaction rating is at least 75%

Programme Area: Competency		
Desired outcome: Participants are able to plan and implement current and emerging ICT technologies and e-government applications after 2 years.		
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**
Planned and implemented ICT technologies and e-government applications	• Number of agencies able to plan and implement e-government applications	• 1 agency per year
	• Number of participants trained to create and implement e-government applications	• 100 participants per year
	• Number of agencies able to plan and implement current and emerging ICT technologies	• 2 agencies per year
	• Number of participants trained to create and implement a plan for current and emerging ICT technologies	• 100 participants per year

Programme Area: Programme Management		
Desired outcome: A pool of ICT for development resource persons through training of trainers and networking within 1 year.		
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**
Pool of ICTD resource persons	• Number of resource persons who will conduct the programme	• 2 key resource persons per module
	• Number of training of trainers conducted	• At least 2 training of trainers per year
	• Number of training of trainers participants	• At least 10 participants per training of trainers
	• Number of partnerships / alliances established	• 2 alliances/partnerships per year
	• Highly competent ICTD trainers / resource persons	• Continuing competency programmes for ICTD resource persons
	• Partnerships with internationally recognized academes / organizations	• Establish linkages / partnerships

Programme Area: External Impact		
Desired outcome: Government policymakers and managers equipped with the knowledge and skills of strategically integrating ICT in development programmes and policies after 3 years.		
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**
Competent government policymakers and managers	• Number of ICTD integrated programmes developed by participants of the Academy	• 2 programmes per year
	• Number of government policymakers and managers equipped with ICT skills and knowledge	• 100 per year
	• Comparability with international standards	• Presence of world-class government ICT professionals
	• Highly competent government policymakers and managers	• Continuing competency programmes for government policymakers and managers
Strategically integrated ICT in development programmes and policies	• Number of developed ICTD integrated policies	• Increased number of developed ICTD integrated policies by 20%
	• Number of implemented ICTD integrated programmes	• Increased number of developed ICTD integrated programmes by 20%
	• Number of implemented ICTD integrated policies	• Increased number of issued ICTD integrated policies by 20%

Annex B.2

NCI Courses in the Second Semester of Calendar Year 2012

Courses / Course Code	Number of hours	Schedule
e-GOVERNMENT MANAGEMENT		
Management Programme for e-Governance	160	23 July ~ 17 August
Enterprise Architecture and eServices Strategic Planning	40	12 ~ 16 November
ISSP Seminar	24	18 ~ 20 July 24 ~ 26 October
ICT Resource Acquisition (Project Terms of Reference)	40	3 ~ 7 September
Project Management	40	24 ~ 28 September
Managing ICT Services in Government-ITIL Framework	24	8 ~ 10 August
IT Audit, Security and Governance	40	1 ~ 5 October
Network and Information Security and Privacy	24	1 ~ 3 August
ICTD Essentials for Government Managers	40	17 ~ 21 September
ICT for Disaster Risk Reduction, Climate Change, Green Growth and Sustainable Development	40	13 ~ 17 August
Technology Life Cycle Management	16	13 ~ 14 September
Information Security for Government Officials	16	8 ~ 9 October
Policy Making in the Information Age	16	8 ~ 9 November
APPLICATIONS DEVELOPMENT		
JAVA Programming	100	9 July ~ 10 August 3 September ~ 5 October 12 November ~ 17 December
PHP Hyptertext Pre-Processor Programming	76	6 August ~ 3 September
System Analysis and Design	256	1 October ~ 15 January (2013)
HTML Webpage Development	68	3 ~ 25 September
2D Animation Course	40	3 ~ 27 July
IMAGE Editing	40	17 ~ 21 September 1 ~ 5 October
Collaborative Software	24	25 ~ 27 October
Social Media in Governance	24	28 ~ 30 August
Effective Presentation	24	26 ~ 28 September
TECHNOLOGY SOLUTIONS		
Network Specialist Course Semester 1	72	July ~ 1 September 18 August ~ 13 October 27 October ~ 5 January (2013) 1 December ~ 2 February (2013
Network Specialist Course Semester 2	72	4 August ~ 29 September 15 September ~ 10 November 27 October ~ 5 January (2013)
Network Specialist Course Semester 3	72	18 August ~ 13 October 13 October ~ 15 December
Network Specialist Course Semester 4	72	18 August ~ 13 October 27 October ~ 5 January (2013)
Computer and Internet Literacy	40	24 ~ 28 September 5 ~ 9 November
Linux System Administration (Level 1)	80	24 September ~ 12 October

Annex B.3

Key Activities Based on Indicators and Targets Identified for the Academy Programme Roll-out in the Philippines

Programme Area: Curriculum

Desired outcome: A comprehensive, high-level ICT for Development (ICTD) Programme customized for Philippine government managers such as Division Chiefs, Directors, Commissioners and would-be managers within 1 year.

Dimensions	Indicators of Performance	Targets	Key Activities
ICT for Development Programme	• Number of customized ICTD Programme conducted / implemented	• At least 4 Academy modules embedded in other modules per semester • At least 3 straight Academy modules per semester	• Customization and localization of Academy Programme modules • Integration of Academy Programme modules into NCI courses • Establishment of partnerships with various government agencies and institutions
	• Number of customized ICTD Programme enhanced	• 3 customized modules per year	
	• Increased number of computer training laboratories	• Tie-up with local ICT training institutions, regional offices, state universities and colleges	
	• Number of partners for off site and remote operations / trainings		

Desired outcome: A modular programme approach to ensure flexibility to different learning participants and/or situations within 1 year.

Dimensions	Indicators of Performance	Targets	Key Activities
Modular Programme	• Number of modules to be included per programme	• At least 2 modules per programme	• Customization and localization of Academy Programme modules • Integration of Academy Programme modules into NCI courses • Establishment of partnerships with various government agencies and institutions • Conduct of M&E activities for Academy-related activities
	• Increased number of computer training laboratories	• Tie-up with local ICT training institutions, regional offices, state universities and colleges	
	• Number of partners for offsite and remote operations / trainings		
Flexibility	• Number of sector-specific modular programme conducted / implemented	• At least 2 sector-specific modules per semester	
	• Number of participants trained in sector-specific programme developed	• 100 participants per year	
	• Number of sector-specific modular programme developed	• 2 programmes per year	
	• Extent of correspondence between the sectoral programmes and specific needs	• Satisfaction rating is at least 75%	

Programme Area: Competency			
Desired outcome: Participants are able to plan and implement current and emerging ICT technologies and e-government applications after 2 years.			
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
Planned and implemented ICT technologies and e-government applications	• Number of agencies able to plan and implement e-government applications	• 1 agency per year	• Establishment of partnerships with various government agencies and institutions • Integration of Academy Programme modules into NCI courses
	• Number of participants trained to create and implement e-government applications	• 100 participants per year	
	• Number of agencies able to plan and implement current and emerging ICT technologies	• 2 agencies per year	
	• Number of participants trained to create and implement a plan for current and emerging ICT technologies	• 100 participants per year	

Programme Area: Programme Management			
Desired outcome: A pool of ICT for development resource persons through training of trainers and networking with in 1 year.			
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
Pool of ICTD resource persons	• Number of resource persons who will conduct the programme	• 2 key resource persons per module	• Establishment of partnerships with various government agencies and institution • Integration of Academy Programme modules into NCI courses • Marketing and promotion of Academy Programme course offerings
	• Number of training of trainers conducted	• At least 2 training of trainers per year	
	• Number of training of trainers participants	• At least 10 participants per training of trainers	
	• Number of partnerships / alliances established	• 2 alliances/partnerships per year	
	• Highly competent ICTD trainers /resource persons	• Continuing competency programmes for ICTD resource persons	
	• Partnerships with internationally recognized academes / organizations	• Establish linkages / partnerships	

Programme Area: External Impact			
Desired outcome: Government policymakers and managers equipped with the knowledge and skills of strategically integrating ICT in development programmes and policies after 3 years.			
Dimensions	**Indicators of Performance**	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
Competent government policymakers and managers	• Number of ICTD integrated programmes developed by participants of the Academy	• 2 programmes per year	• Customization and localization of Academy Programme modules • Integration of Academy Programme modules into NCI courses • Establishment of partnerships with various government agencies and institutions • Conduct of M&E activities for Academy-related activities • Marketing and promotion of Academy Programme course offerings
	• Number of government policymakers and managers equipped with ICT skills and knowledge	• 100 per year	
	• Comparability with international standards	• Presence of world-class government ICT professionals	
	• Highly competent government policymakers and managers	• Continuing competency programmes for government policymakers and managers	
Strategically integrated ICT in development programmes and policies	• Number of developed ICTD integrated policies	• Increased number of developed ICTD integrated policies by 20%	
	• Number of implemented ICTD integrated programmes	• Increased number of developed ICTD integrated programmes by 20%	
	• Number of implemented ICTD integrated policies	• Increased number of issued ICTD integrated policies by 20%	

Annex B. 4

National Computer Institute
Post-Training Evaluation

Course Evaluation

	Poor (1)	Fair (2)	Good (3)	Very Good (4)	Excellent (5)
I. Course Design					
1. The objectives of the course were clearly defined	1	2	3	4	5
2. Based on the objectives, your expectations were fulfilled	1	2	3	4	5
3. The topics covered in the course were:	1	2	3	4	5
a. Relevant to the course	1	2	3	4	5
b. Properly sequenced	1	2	3	4	5
c. Given sufficient time	1	2	3	4	5
d. Just right in terms of difficulty	1	2	3	4	5
II. Course Methodology					
1. Adequate time was allotted for:					
a. Lecture	1	2	3	4	5
b. Computer hands-on	1	2	3	4	5
c. Exercises	1	2	3	4	5
d. Exams	1	2	3	4	5
III. Materials					
1. The prescribed reference reading materials were:					
a. Suitable	1	2	3	4	5
b. Adequate	1	2	3	4	5
c. Easy to understand	1	2	3	4	5
d. Well-formatted/presented	1	2	3	4	5
2. The presentations used were supportive of the lecture	1	2	3	4	5
IV. Facilities					
1. The computer facilities were adequate	1	2	3	4	5
2. The classroom facilities (ventilation, etc.) were adequate	1	2	3	4	5
3. The library facilities were adequate	1	2	3	4	5
V. Self-Evaluation					
1. Indicate below your assessment of your knowledge of the course:					
a. Before the course	1	2	3	4	5
b. After the course	1	2	3	4	5

Comments and Suggestions:

Instructor Evaluation

	Poor (1)	Fair (2)	Good (3)	Very Good (4)	Excellent (5)
I. Mastery of the Subject Matter					
1. Knowledgeable about the subject matter	1	2	3	4	5
2. Presents the topic in a well organized manner	1	2	3	4	5
3. Injects current developments relevant to the course	1	2	3	4	5
4. Uses notes wisely	1	2	3	4	5
Comments:					
II. Instructional Methodology					
1. Able to explain theories and concepts clearly					
2. Gives adequate exercise / assignments	1	2	3	4	5
3. Utilizes instructional materials effectively	1	2	3	4	5
4. Encourages audience participation	1	2	3	4	5
5. Makes use of given time efficiently	1	2	3	4	5
Comments:					
III. Communication Skills					
1. Projects a clear and audible voice	1	2	3	4	5
2. Expresses ideas clearly, fluently and spontaneously	1	2	3	4	5
Comments:					
IV. Classroom Management					
1. Able to inspire and maintain interest	1	2	3	4	5
2. Willingness to help the participant	1	2	3	4	5
3. Open to criticism and accepts alternative solutions	1	2	3	4	5
4. Able to maintain classroom discipline and control	1	2	3	4	5
Comments:					
V. Personal Qualities					
1. Follow the time duration (class hours)	1	2	3	4	5
2. Dresses neatly and appropriately	1	2	3	4	5
3. Courteous in answering questions	1	2	3	4	5
4. Projects image of authority	1	2	3	4	5
Comments:					

Annex B.5

National Computer Institute
NCI Trainings Containing UN-APCICT Academy Modules
Stakeholders' Feedback Survey Form

The National Computer Institute (NCI) of the National Computer Center (NCC) is currently gathering feedback in the delivery of its services and assistance to our stakeholders. Your feedback about our services is most valuable.

May we request that you answer each item as candidly as possible. We assure you that your answers will be treated confidentially.

Please check the appropriate box corresponding to your answer. Kindly return this feedback form to your Course Officer or Administrative Assistant after accomplishing.

Thank you for giving us your time and your continued support.

1. Respondent's Demography

A. Gender

- ☐ Male
- ☐ Female

B. Age

- ☐ 20 ~ 30
- ☐ 31 ~ 40
- ☐ 41 ~ 50
- ☐ Above 50

C. Position

- ☐ Staff
- ☐ Supervisor / Section Head
- ☐ Division Head
- ☐ Director
- ☐ Executive

D. Sector

- ☐ Government
- ☐ Non-Government

Please rate the National Computer Institute on the following:

2. Our Specific Product / Service Indicators:

a. Training Management

	1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
Why?					

b. Information / Skills Acquired

	1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
Why?					

c. Training Design / Design of Activity

	1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
Why?					

d. Professional skill and knowledge of resource persons on the subject matter

	1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
Why?					

e. Class Interaction (effectiveness and responsiveness of resource persons)

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

f. Course Contents

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

g. Adequacy of Facilities / Laboratory

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

h. Personal Capacity (improved knowledge and skills)

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

i. Relevance to Work

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

j. Relevance to Organization

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

3. Client Relations

This pertains to how NCI responded to your organization's needs on manpower capability development through ICT Training.

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied

Why?

4. What other topics do you think should be included in the course? Why?

5. What has been your experience with our services:

During our first year of asistance?

Next year(s) after the first year?

6. What have you gained from the services / assistance that we have provided?

7. Please state your suggestion(s) on how we can improve our service / product / team.

Annex B.6

National Computer Institute
NCI Trainings Containing UN-APCICT Academy Modules
Stakeholders' Feedback Survey Results as of 8 October 2012

The National Computer Institute (NCI) of the National Computer Center (NCC) is currently gathering feedback in the delivery of its services and assistance to our stakeholders. Your feedback about our services is most valuable.

May we request that you answer each item as candidly as possible. We assure you that your answers will be treated confidentially.

Please check the appropriate box corresponding to your answer. Kindly return this feedback form to your Course Officer or Administrative Assistant after accomplishing.

Thank you for giving us your time and your continued support.

1. Respondent's Demography

A. Gender	Total	Percentage
☐ Male	**42**	**70%**
☐ Female	**18**	**30%**
	60	**100%**

B. Age	Total	Percentage
☐ 20 ~ 30	**18**	**30%**
☐ 31 ~ 40	**23**	**38%**
☐ 41 ~ 50	**14**	**23%**
☐ Above 50	**5**	**8%**
	60	**100%**

C. Position	Total	Percentage
☐ Staff	**36**	**64%**
☐ Supervisor / Section Head	**11**	**20%**
☐ Division Head	**7**	**13%**
☐ Director	**2**	**3%**
☐ Executive	**0**	**0%**
	56	**100%**

D. Sector	Total	Percentage
☐ Government	**58**	**100%**
☐ Non-Government	**0**	**0%**
	58	**100%**

Please rate the National Computer Institute on the following:

2. Our Specific Product / Service Indicators:

a. Training Management

	1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
	0	0	10	41	9
Why?	0%	0%	17%	68%	15%

Training management staff members are all approachable and they have been very helpful.
Accommodating and facilitative during the whole duration of the training.
Friendly, accommodating and clear instructions.
Very accommodating.
Impressive.
All of them are very accommodating and friendly.
Good facilities - room, time management, food and beverage, resource persons and staff.
Some of the topics are not related to my job.
**
The training regarding Network and Information Security was well-presented.
Ang galing ng instructor. (The instructor was very good.)
The trainer is so impressive.
Training aspect was managed properly.
The lecturer is an excellent lecturer.
Did follow-ups; overall training was well-managed.
Very relevant. However, it may be better if the recommended positions / level of attendees for the trainings will be specified so agencies can better assess the people to send for the trainings.
Speaker is very knowledgeable on subject matter.

b. Information / Skills Acquired

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	0	15	35	7
0%	0%	26%	61%	12%

Why?

Information supplied / imparted during the course were interesting.
Information overload.
New ideas.
Additional information and skills.
The course was not technical in nature overall, hence I did not get any insights regarding how audit is actually done in the real world.
**
Realistic examples were given.
Very broad information. Topics are very well presented.
Topics were delivered based from the experiences of the lecturer.
Topics are relevant to my current job.
The speaker is very knowledgeable and the accommodation is good.
We were well-informed.
Resource speaker is very skilled and full of information to disseminate.
New and gained directions on how to go about the task.
Resource speaker is fully equipped with knowledge, ideas and experience.
Very knowledgeable.

c. Training Design / Design of Activity

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	2	14	36	4
0%	4%	25%	64%	7%

Why?

Except that some of the topics discussed by the first speaker were also discussed by the second resource person, thus providing lesser time on other topics.
Satisfactory.
Day 1 topics were not discussed.
**
Activities were highly appreciated since participants were given the time to plan the necessary policy applicable for the agency.
I learn how to design our network.
Please improve hand-outs.
The materials were not strictly followed by the lecturer.
Not clearly stated if training or seminar.
Included lectures and actual insights on the topic.
Properly arranged accordingly with activities.
Very resourceful.

d. Professional skill and knowledge of resource persons on the subject matter

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	0	5	27	28
0%	0%	9%	47%	44%

Why?

They've been trained and no doubt considered two of the best practitioners in town (based on their credentials); but sometimes I got bored along the way.
Professional.
Can deliver more techniques on IT auditing and IS concepts.
The 2nd speaker did not elaborate clearly his subject matter.
**
Mr. John Macasio knows his presentation and gives realistic examples / scenarios.
The lecturer had a broad knowledge and experience and open to all.
Topics were delivered based from the experiences of the lecturer.
His mastery in the course is amazing, he is knowledgeable in all aspect regarding to the topic that he delivered.
He can relate all topics with his experiences.
Very well qualified to talk about the topic since the speaker is a practitioner.
Because of an excellent speaker.
Elaborates thoroughly.

e. Class Interaction (effectiveness and responsiveness of resource persons)

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	0	10	29	17
0%	0%	18%	52%	30%

Why?

Peer members are warm and generous with their experiences.
Active participation.
Very effective resource persons.
**
Participants were actively participating.
Participants seem to be satisfied with just participating.
Very informative and casual (full of meat).
Shows thoughts and experience.

f. Course Contents

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
1	2	17	29	9
2%	3%	29%	50%	16%

Why?

Not all topics satisfactory.
It is not my interest.
This needs to be extended and put some shows that can interest not IT practitioners to understand the topics.
As per discussion, the course contents were satisfactorily delivered.
Lacks technical principles and actual practices.
**
Very informative.
TY for the lecturer.
Can be applied directly to the workplace.
Would be better if hand-outs on the other presented slides were also provided.
Adds additional data / information to elaborate subject.

g. Adequacy of Facilities / Laboratory

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	1	4	14	4
0%	4%	17%	61%	17%

Why?

Needs proper maintenance or upgrade.
**
Seminar room was well-ventilated.
Comfortable.
No hands-on.
We are cramped in the lecture room, we need more space.
With all resources needed by the students and speakers.
Well-organized.

h. Personal Capacity (improved knowledge and skills)

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	0	17	34	8
0%	0%	29%	58%	14%

Learned a lot.
**
More knowledge to learn.
TY for the lecturer.
Well-experienced.

i. Relevance to Work

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	2	16	27	13
0%	3%	28%	47%	22%

Why?

Applicable to work.
All I learned was purely conceptual.
The lecturer did not follow the materials distributed.
Very relevant / related.
Well-adopted.

j. Relevance to Organization

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	1	12	28	17
0%	2%	21%	48%	29%

Why?

Very relevant.
**
It provides information on how to secure organization information asset.
Very relevant, current.
Well-trained and organized.

3. Client Relations

This pertains to how NCI responded to your organization's needs on manpower capability development through ICT Training.

1 Not at all satisfied	2 Slightly satisfied	3 Moderately satisfied	4 Very satisfied	5 Extremely satisfied
0	0	12	34	10
0%	0%	21%	61%	18%

Why?

Responsive to clients' needs.
Relationship of IT/IS auditing with monitoring and evaluation processes; how are they different?
**
We need this type of training.
Not in the position to comment.
Understand the issues and needs of our agency

4. What other topics do you think should be included in the course? Why?

Application to government set-up.
Actual detection and application of theories, i.e. fraud, etc.
There has to be a mock audit of a system.
General examples and general application of the theories.
All topics included.
More on technical topics.
Hands-on training.
Actual penetration testing to augment IT audit.
**
I think all have been discussed well; although a more in-depth discussion should be exercised.
Computer hacking hands-on.
Some hardcore or in-depth IT / programme topics.
Actual demonstration on hacking.
It could be added with computer / hands-on application not just on theories / concepts.
Hands-on on how to secure network.
Training for non-IT employees, something more "basic".
Actual hands-on.
Actual draft of the ISP to be accomplished for review and approval.
Current government actions on information security.
Hands-on training (with PC interaction).
Network.
Ethical hacking.
Strengths and weaknesses of commercially available network and communication devices.

5. What has been your experience with our services:

During our first year of asistance?

Great job done by staff.
The people of NCI are very friendly.
Very knowledgeable.
Good!
Well-done.
Slightly satisfied.
Well-accommodated on participant's needs pertaining to training requirements and other technical assistance.
**
Actually, this is my first time, so this is a good one.
Moderately satisfied.
Approachable.
Very satisfied.
Help us in achieving goals.
We have no website before our training.

Next year(s) after the first year?

Very good!
**
Very satisfied.
Improving services.
Continuous learning, enhancing skills.
We built our own website; host it on our office using knowledge in Linux we acquired here.

6. What have you gained from the services / assistance that we have provided?

Adequate knowledge was extended at my end considering that I am not an IT expert.
Knowledge in auditing, management of information and security.
Can generate checklist on the processes, monitoring and evaluation.
Pampered!
Knowledge and friendship.
We've gained knowledge and best practices that will be replicated / re-echoed to other personnel of our organization.
Knowledge, network of friends.
**
This gave me a wider room to explore - with regards our policies on information security.
Skills regarding information security and privacy.
The importance of providing security and privacy on the information asset of an organization. And how to secure the information asset of the organization.
I gained about how to build a power network to avoid the virus and the hackers.
Knowledge.
Improved knowledge and skills.
New information and technology.
More knowledge.
Knowledge on the importance of information security and key concepts on establishing an information security plan for our agency.
Awareness on network security.
Defining security measures.
Additional knowledge in IT that we can use in our job like testing the robustness of our website.

7. Please state your suggestion(s) on how we can improve our service / product / team.

Mock audit of IT system.
Additional group work / case study.
No need for improvement, OK na!
Completeness of topics presented to the participants based on the course outline.
The floor outside the building is very slippery.
**
More exercises and more detailed course outline.
Have a lot of Mr. John Macasio. Very knowledgeable.
More training for new technologies.
Lower training cost, no need of breakfast; materials used by the lecturer should be provided to the participants; participants may be provided with computers during workshops.
Individual laptop or computers during seminars.
Hands-on training (as emphasized).
Clearer objectives of the seminar when sent to the institution.
Please email our office regularly for your technical training schedule.

CASE STUDY 3:

TAJIKISTAN

Partner Organization: Public Fund Civil Internet Policy Initiative

INTRODUCTION

The Academy Programme roll-out in Tajikistan is conducted by a group of partners composed of civil society organizations and led by the Public Fund Civil Internet Policy Initiative (CIPI). CIPI aims to enhance local capacity and policy that enable Internet access and production of new knowledge and information resources through the application of open digital technologies and open standards. Other partners in this initiative include: Public Fund Internet (PFI), Association of Internet Service Providers (ISPA), Public organization Centre ICT (CICT), Public organization Information Analytical and Education Centre MATHEMA, and Public organization Center of Information Technology KOVA. Efforts in this direction are supported by the ICT Council under the President of Tajikistan, the Open Society Institute - Assistance Foundation in Tajikistan and the United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Centre for Information and Communication Technology for Development (UN-APCICT).

STATUS OF THE ACADEMY PROGRAMME ROLL-OUT

Key Targets for Academy Programme Roll-out for the Years 2012 ~ 2014

There are two main objectives in the national roll-out of the Academy Programme in 2012-2014: (1) the establishment of the Government Chief Information Officer (GCIO) Institute, and (2) the standardization of the information and communication technology for development (ICTD) training module as a compulsory course for students across all specialties in local universities in Tajikistan. In support of these goals, the following key targets were identified across four programme areas: competency, curriculum, programme management and external impact.

Regarding competency, a key target is to develop partnerships with policymakers who are trained through the Academy modules and competent in ICTD. Furthermore, the Academy Programme seeks to provide a venue for the formulation of policy documents that are focused on efficient, effective and innovative applications of ICT for public sector reform.

In terms of curriculum, the institutionalization of the Chief Information Officer (CIO) in the academic community is set as a desired outcome. In addition, it is proposed that universities and other academic institutions will participate in the implementation of the approved Academy modules.

For programme management, effective management of the Academy roll-out by partner organizations through multi-stakeholder partnership is envisioned.

Finally, through the implementation of the Academy Programme roll-out, it is expected that the active application of ICTs will help facilitate the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The specific measurement indicators and targets developed for the Academy Programme roll-out in 2012-2014 are presented in Annex C.1. For the list of indicators developed for the various dimensions in each programme area, see Annex C.2.

Figure 13: Presentation of localized Primer in Dushanbe on 30 January 2013

Key Activities Implemented in Support of Academy Programme Roll-out

Several key activities were undertaken to support the Academy Programme roll-out. One of the main activities focused on the customization and localization of Primer 1: An Introduction to ICT for Development that was originally developed by UN-APCICT as a learning resource for institutions of higher education. Seven local ICTD case studies have been developed as part of the primer localization process. These cases examined the following topics:

1. Free and open source software (FOSS) in higher education establishments
2. Meeting the needs of rural schools from the experience of Relief International and Schools Online
3. The essence of an operating system neutral IT training curriculum in secondary school
4. The experience of a labour migrant Safarmoh in discovering Internet and social media
5. The advantages of using mobile ICTs in the labour market from the experience of Dastrasi
6. MoMetavonem to encourage citizens' participation in meeting problems of the city
7. The mobile phone as a catalyst of panic or mirror of social issues

Other important activities that were undertaken in support of the Academy Programme roll-out include a series of seminars on e-government that was conducted for members of the ICT Council in the provinces of Khatlon, Sughd and Badakhshan. Similarly, lectures on e-government were undertaken for civil servants who were included in the ICT Council action plan, particularly for civil servants in the Institute of Professional Development and the Communication Service under the Government of Tajikistan. Open lectures on Primer 1 were also given in local universities, which paved the way for the adoption of this primer for students at the Institute of Entrepreneurship and Management.

The drafting of the Master Plan for e-Government was a significant initiative that was undertaken to support the roll-out of the Academy Programme. This initiative consisted of two drafts. The first draft pertained to the National Programme for the Implementation of e-Government, 2013-2015. Within this National Programme, the following tasks are set forth: (1) the institutionalization of ICTD as a compulsory training module for undergraduate students in all disciplines, with particular emphasis on the student's area of study (e.g., ICTD for Biology courses), (2) the creation of a master's degree programme that focuses on ICTD, and (3) the establishment of a GCIO Institute. The second draft contained the action plans in line with ICTD for 2013-2015.

More recently, in January - February 2013, the localized version of Primer 1 was

presented across Tajikistan. A two-phase process was adopted to make the presentations more effective. The first round of presentations were conducted in Dushanbe on 30 January 2013 and was followed by presentations in the other cities of Tajikistan - Khorugh (2 February 2013), Qurghonteppa (7 February 2013), Khujand (8 February 2013) and Kulob (8 February 2013). During these presentations, the participants had an opportunity to learn about the goal, objectives and the different sections of Primer 1 from its author, Dr. Usha Reddi through a Skype conference. As the presentations were conducted in universities, the author was introduced as a social scientist to help generate interest among the participants. In the second round of presentations in February 2013, participants were informed that they can share their views and comments. The final presentation of Primer 1, along with a roundtable discussion, was organized on 11 February 2013.

Challenges Encountered and Lessons Learned in the Academy Programme Roll-out

Figure 14: Presentation of localized Primer in Khorugh on 3 February 2013

Figure 15: Mr. Ruzadorov, Secretary to the ICT Council under the President of Tajikistan hands over localized Primer to the Mr. Jumaev, Secretary to the branch of Council in the Autonomous Province of Mountainous Badakshan, 2 February 2013

Proponents of the Academy Programme in Tajikistan have identified several challenges that they have encountered in the implementation of different activities in support of the programme roll-out. One of these challenges is the localization of the ICT terminology and the editing of translated materials. To address this challenge, proponents constantly read through both original (English) and translated (Tajik) versions of the materials. Furthermore, they conducted regular discussions with a group of translators to improve the accuracy and reliability of the translation.

A second challenge is related to the process of developing the local case studies. As the involvement of local experts in the development of the case studies was sought, proponents observed that local experts had difficulty in putting down their knowledge, experiences and practices in written form. In response to this difficulty, proponents resorted to undertaking interviews with local experts, assisting in the writing process, and conducting case validation checks with these experts. In the process, proponents also engaged local experts as co-authors of the case study reports.

Third, Academy Programme proponents have highlighted the difficulty of convincing

state agencies on the importance of establishing a GCIO Institute. Support for the significance of the GCIO was generated by first creating a small group of six experts from a larger multi-stakeholder working group composed of 17 members. This proved to be beneficial as the members of the small group assisted in providing explanations to their colleagues about the benefits of the GCIO for e-government development during the process of drafting the National Master Plan on e-Government.

A fourth difficulty that Academy Programme proponents in Tajikistan have experienced is related to their goal of generating support for ICTD as a key component in training in different sectors. To address this challenge, the following strategies were employed: adapting localized modules for ICTD trainings, identifying potential ICTD champions in key institutions, creating and sustaining multi-stakeholder partnerships in capacity-building for ICTD, and conducting presentations about ICTD in different events and venues.

Key Results Based on Indicators and Targets Identified for the Academy Programme Roll-out

For the development of the first desired outcome - competency, which aims to develop competent ICTD policymakers, no specific action has been undertaken yet. However, proponents plan to conduct training of trainers for local policymakers in August 2013, with specific focus on Primer 1 and modules 9 and 10 of the Academy Programme.

Annex C.3 shows the actions that have been undertaken in line with the indicators and targets developed for the Academy Programme roll-out. Annex C.4 presents the key activities that have been conducted in line with the various dimensions of the Academy Programme roll-out.

MONITORING AND EVALUATION EXPERIENCE IN THE ACADEMY PROGRAMME ROLL-OUT

Monitoring and Evaluation Activities Undertaken in the Academy Programme Roll-out

Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) activities were undertaken during the presentation of the localized version of Primer 1 at universities in different provinces and at the final presentation that included a roundtable discussion. After each presentation, proponents conducted a post-presentation evaluation to identify the strengths and weaknesses of the event. In addition to presenting the localized version of Primer 1, the local case studies were also presented by the authors. This strategy enabled the authors/presenters to gather immediate feedback regarding their own case studies. Proponents also instructed participants to identify errors in the Primer so that they can be rectified prior to the finalization of the Primer in the summer of 2013.

In the final presentation and discussion in Dushanbe, participants were given the opportunity to provide feedback and raise questions regarding the primer and the local case studies. Proponents arranged a roundtable discussion involving experienced teachers from the Institute of Entrepreneurship and Service (IES), which has recently implemented a newly-approved ICTD training module based on Primer 1. Professor Uktam Jumaev shared his experience from this process to participants. Professor Komilov, former rector of IES, who read through the Primer found it very useful as textbook for students of various specialties and for experts of different fields. Some participants who were present during the first phase of presentations also attended this event and offered feedback, questions and other insights about the presentation.

Benefits and Advantages of Monitoring and Evaluating the Academy Programme Roll-out

Group discussions about the presentations, particularly about what went well and what could be improved from the presentation, enabled the group to pay closer attention to some important points in the presentation, thus serving as a way to monitor the group and as input on how to improve succeeding presentations. In addition, this process helped to encourage co-authors of case studies to participate as presenters of their cases as well as engage the participants in the roundtable discussions.

Figure 16: Photos from the final presentation and roundtable discussion on Primer 1 in Dushanbe on 11 February 2013

Challenges and Lessons Learned from Undertaking M&E for the Academy Programme Roll-out

One of the main challenges that proponents have encountered in implementing the Academy Programme in Tajikistan is the lack of attention given by non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and public sector institutions to M&E processes. Thus, the concept of M&E is not a top priority among many NGOs. To address this, proponents insisted on the inclusion of M&E as a required or compulsory step in the Action Plan or the implementation process for the National Master Plan for e-Government.

Additionally, proponents themselves have found it challenging to follow the M&E Plan because they are still in the initial stage of developing a deeper understanding and appreciation for M&E as an essential part of their organizational culture. Although proponents have utilized the logframe matrix as part of their project management process, their use of this tool has been independent of the project parameters. Indeed, as one of the main project proponents noted, there is a need to understand that an excellent project plan cannot lead to successful outputs without M&E as an integral component. The importance of M&E further arises when undertaking a multi-stakeholder project as the availability of M&E tools and results enable different stakeholders to monitor and evaluate the performance of each partner involved in the project. In this way, partners are able to mutually support one another to improve performance.

Figure 17: Participants of the roundtable discussion on Primer 1 in Dushanbe on 11 February 2013

Suggested Strategies and Future Actions for Monitoring and Evaluation the Academy Programme Roll-out

Given these realizations about the value of M&E in project management, proponents suggest practicing M&E not only in relation the Academy Programme but also in the implementation of their other projects. Thus, proponents have highlighted the need to integrate M&E as part of their organizational project management culture.

However, proponents have noted that this adoption of M&E as an important element of the project management culture of their organization should be conducted in an organic manner. As such, M&E tools and processes should be developed and implemented following the local culture.

Figure 18: Professor Komilov sharing his impression of Primer 1

Annex C.1

Targets for Academy Programme Roll-out in Tajikistan for the period 2012 ~ 2014

Programme Area: Competency	
Desired outcome (CM1): Partners through Academy modules trained competent ICTD policymakers within 1 year.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• List of partners	• Available capacity
• Number of partners involved	• 5 partners for 12 months
• Available pool of trainers	• Available capacity (5 trainers)
• Number of applied modules	• 2 modules for 2012-2013 academic year
• Number of trained PMs	• 100 within a year
• Growth of pool of trainers	• 10 trainers
• Number of certified PMs	• 10 within a year
• Active involvement of local PMs in ICTD initiatives	• 2 designed and launched ICTD initiatives
Desired outcome (CM2): Policy documents that are focused on efficient, effective and innovative applications of ICTs for public sector reform within 2 years	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Competency for policy development	• Available capacity
• Number of ICTD champions	• 2 ICTD champions
• Number of developed and accepted documents	• 2 accepted policy documents
• Growth of the state budget line items for development and implementation of the public e-services	• 4 types of e-services available online
• Availability of M&E as a critical success factor of e-government initiatives	• 2 developed and successfully implemented e-government initiatives on the basis of the localized M&E toolkit
• Availability (anywhere, anytime) and inclusiveness of cross-platform public e-services	• 2 public e-services available on web and mobile phones
• Level of usage of public e-services	• 20% of implemented e-services
• Percentage of initiatives implemented through multi-stakeholder partnership	• 2 public e-services (50%) implemented through multi-stakeholder partnership
• e-Government Development Index improvement	• 20% of the current index in 2-year period

Programme Area: Curriculum	
Desired outcome (CR1): Institutionalization of CIO in academic community after 2 years.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Localized modules of Academy	• 8+1 (Primer 1) + 2 (Modules 9, 10)
• Approved ICTD elective training modules for students	• All localized modules of Academy
• Number of universities with ICTD strategic action plans	• University members of Tajik Academic Research and Education Networking Association (TARENA), which is one of the NGO partners that unites 13 universities and 4 research institutions at the time
• Growth of applied training modules on ICTD across the disciplines	• Locally standardized ICTD training module based on UN-APCICT modules
• Number of universities that offer CIO study programmes	• 4 universities, including Institute of Professional Development

Desired outcome (CR2): Universities that implement the designed and approved modules within 1 year

Indicators of Performance	Targets
• Localized modules of Academy	• 8+1 (Primer 1) + 2 (Modules 9, 10)
• Number of resource persons	• 5 resource persons
• Number of universities that adapt and apply the Academy modules	• 2 universities
• Number of used modules	• 5 modules

Programme Area: Programme Management	
Desired outcome (PM1): Academy roll-out is effectively managed by partner organizations through multi-stakeholder partnerships after 1 year.	
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**
• Number of partner organizations	• 5 partner organizations
• Growth of the budget for the Academy roll-out	• Up to USD 80,000
• Availability and improvement of other areas' indicators	• 25 % increase of eGDI, KEI, NRI
• Usage of M&E as a common tool for effective management by all partners	• 5 partners
• Availability of localized UN-APCICT Virtual Academy	• At least modules 3, 6, 7 after 1 year

Annex C.2

Measurement Indicators Developed for the Various Dimensions of the Academy Programme

Measurement Indicators	Desired Outcomes per Dimension					
	CM 1	CM 2	CR 1	CR 2	PM	EI
List of partners		☑	☑		☑	
Number of localized modules / Modules to be localized		☑	☑	☑	☑	
Available pool of trainers					☑	
Number of partners involved		☑	☑	☑	☑	
Number of modules applied						
Number of trained policymakers						
Growth of pools of trainers					☑	
Number of certified policymakers						
Active involvement of local policymakers in ICTD initiatives		☑	☑		☑	☑
Number of ICTD champions		☑	☑	☑		
Number of developed and accepted documents		☑	☑	☑		
Growth of state budget line items for public e-services						
Availability of M&E as a critical success factor		☑			☑	
Level of usage of public e-services		☑				☑
Initiatives implemented through MSP		☑	☑	☑	☑	
EGDI improvement						
Approved ICTD training module (elective / compulsory)		☑				
Number of universities with strategic ICTD actions plan						
Growth of applied training modules on ICTD across disciplines		☑				
Number of universities that offer CIO study programme						
Number of resource persons		☑		☑		
Number of universities that adapt and apply Academy module				☑		
Growth of the budget for the Academy roll-out						
Availability of the UN-APCICT Virtual Academy						
Number of ICT initiatives to achieve MDGs		☑	☑	☑	☑	
Growth of MDGs						☑

Annex C.3

Key Activities Based on Indicators and Targets Identified for the Academy Programme Roll-out in Tajikistan

Programme Area: Competency		
Desired outcome (CM2): Policy documents that are focused on efficient, effective and innovative applications of ICTs for public sector reform within 2 years		
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
• Competency for policy development	• Available capacity	• Drafted Master Plan for e-Government development • Master Plan included localized modules based on Academy Programme and Primer 1 • Multi-stakeholder partnerships as an integral component in all activities
• Number of ICTD champions	• 2 ICTD champions	
• Number of developed and accepted documents	• 2 accepted policy documents	
• Growth of the state budget line items for development and implementation of the public e-services	• 4 types of e-services available online	
• Availability of M&E as a critical success factor of e-government initiatives	• 2 developed and successfully implemented e-government initiatives on the basis of the localized M&E toolkit	
• Availability (anywhere, anytime) and inclusiveness of cross-platform public e-services	• 2 public e-services available on web and mobile phones	
• Level of usage of public e-services	• 20% of implemented e-services	
• Percentage of initiatives implemented through multi-stakeholder partnership	• 2 public e-services (50%) implemented through multi-stakeholder partnership	
• e-Government Development Index improvement	• 20% of the current index in 2-year period	

Programme Area: Curriculum		
Desired outcome (CR1): Institutionalization of CIO in academic community after 2 years		
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
• Localized modules of Academy	• 8+1 (Primer 1) + 2 (Modules 9, 10)	• Drafted Master Plan for e-Government development • Following the Master Plan, advocated for the institutionalization of the GCIO and the adoption of ICTD modules in universities • Multi-stakeholder partnerships as an integral component in all activities
• Approved ICTD elective training modules for students	• All localized modules of Academy	
• Number of universities with ICTD strategic action plans	• University-members of Tajik Academic Research and Education Networking Association (TARENA), which is one of the NGO-partners that unites 13 universities and 4 research institutions at the time	
• Growth of applied training modules on ICTD across the disciplines	• Locally standardized ICTD training module based on UN-APCICT modules	
• Number of universities that offer CIO study programmes	• 4 universities, including Institute of Professional Development	
Desired outcome (CR2): Universities that implement the designed and approved modules within 1 year		
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
• Localized modules of Academy	• 8+1 (Primer1) + 2 (Modules 9, 10)	• Multi-stakeholder partnerships as an integral component in all activities
• Number of resource persons	• 5 resource persons	
• Number of universities that adapt and apply the Academy modules	• 2 universities	
• Number of used modules	• 5 modules	

Programme Area: Programme Management		
Desired outcome (PM1): Academy roll-out is effectively managed by partner organizations through multi-stakeholder partnerships after 1 year		
Indicators of Performance	**Targets**	**Key Activities**
• Number of partner organizations	• 5 partner organizations	• Multi-stakeholder partnerships as an integral component in all activities • Following the Master Plan, advocated for the institutionalization of the GCIO and the adoption of ICTD modules in universities • Conducted open lectures and master classes for potential trainers
• Growth of the budget for the Academy roll-out	• Up to USD 80,000	
• Availability and improvement of other areas' indicators	• 25 % increase of eGDI, KEI, NRI	
• Usage of M&E as a common tool for effective management by all partners	• 5 partners	
• Availability of localized APCICT Virtual Academy	• At least modules 3, 6, 7 after 1 year	

Annex C.4

Key Activities Conducted for the Various Dimensions of the Academy Programme

Measurement Indicators	Desired Outcomes per Dimension				
	CM 2	CR 1	CR 2	PM	EI
List of partners	Drafted Master Plan for e-Government development			Multi-stakeholder partnerships as an integral component in all activities	
Number of localized modules / Modules to be localized	Master Plan including localized modules based on Academy Programme and Primer 1	Following the Master Plan, advocated for the institutionalization of the GCIO and the adoption of ICTD modules in universities			
Available pool of trainers				Conducted open lectures and master classes for potential trainers	
Number of partners involved	Multi-stakeholder partnerships as an integral component in all activities				
Growth of pools of trainers				Conducted open lectures and master classes for potential trainers	

UN-APCICT/ESCAP
United Nations Asian and Pacific Training Centre for Information
and Communication Technology for Development
5th Floor, G-Tower, 24-4 Songdo-dong,
Yeonsu-gu, Incheon, Republic of Korea

www.unapcict.org

Published under programme supported by Korea International Cooperation Agency (KOICA)